

Appeal No. VA97/5/015

AN BINSE LUACHÁLA
VALUATION TRIBUNAL
AN tACHT LUACHÁLA, 1988
VALUATION ACT, 1988

Pat Murphy Industrial Sales & Services Ltd.

APPELLANT

and

Commissioner of Valuation

RESPONDENT

RE: Warehouse, Office & Yard at Map Ref: 1V, Street: City Extension, Townland:
Doughcloyne, ED: Inishkenny, RD: Cork Lower, Co. Cork
Quantum

B E F O R E

Con Guiney - Barrister at Law

Deputy Chairman

Anita Geraghty - Solicitor

Member

George McDonnell - F.C.A.

Member

JUDGMENT OF THE VALUATION TRIBUNAL
ISSUED ON THE 10TH DAY OF JULY, 1998

By Notice of Appeal dated the 13th day of August 1997 the Appellant appealed against the determination of the Commissioner of Valuation in fixing a rateable valuation of £120 on the above described hereditament.

The ground of appeal as set out in the said Notice is that:-

"The valuation is excessive."

The relevant valuation history is that the property was first valued at the 1996 revision at rateable valuation £120. No change was made at first appeal.

A written submission prepared by Mr. Edward Hanafin, BSc. (Surv.), ARICS, ASCS, MIAVI of Lisney, Chartered Surveyors, Cork on behalf of the appellant was received by the Tribunal on the 18th February 1998. Mr. Hanafin in the written submission stated that a fair rateable valuation of the subject premises would be £95 i.e. £2.10 psf on warehouse and £2.70 psf on office block. Mr. Hanafin's submission contained a schedule of seven comparisons.

A written submission prepared by Mr. Peter Conroy, District Valuer in the Valuation Office was received by the Tribunal on 23rd February 1998. Mr. Conroy valued the premises at £3 psf on office block and £2.50 psf on warehouse or alternatively at £2.25 psf on warehouse excluding yard which he separately valued at £0.10 on 14,690 sq.ft.. Mr. Conroy also provided the Tribunal with seven comparisons.

The property comprises a modern single storey warehouse building with office/service block incorporated. It is situated in Doughcloyne Industrial Estate on Sarsfield Road which is the connecting road between Wilton Roundabout and Togher with access to the recently opened Westlink Motorway from the nearby connecting roundabout. It is a standard industrial building with steel portal frame, concrete block walls to 3 metres and double skin to eaves of 6 metres high, pitched insulated double skin metal deck roof and concrete floor.

The appeal proceeded by way of an oral hearing which took place in the District Court Office, Angelsea Street, Cork on the 5th day of March 1998. The Appellant was represented by Mr. Edward Hanafin. The Respondent was represented by Mr. Peter Conroy. Having taken the oath both Valuers adopted as their evidence in chief their respective written submissions which in accordance with the procedures of the Tribunal had been submitted to the Tribunal and exchanged between them in advance of hearing.

In the course of his evidence Mr. Hanafin agreed the dimensions of the property as set out in page 4 of Mr. Conroy's submission, namely:

Offices	2,007 sq.ft.
Warehouse	6,524 sq.ft.
Store	143 sq.ft.

However, Mr. Hanafin did not agree with the inclusion of the first floor over offices as per the valuation contained in Mr. Conroy's written submission.

He stated that this space which was described as being 2,007 sq.ft. in area was a void with headroom of 9 feet. There was no fire certificate for the space and it was accessed by a narrow stairway. In further evidence Mr. Hanafin stated his client had applied for planning permission with respect to the yard adjoining the subject premises. At present this yard was of no benefit to his client.

In his evidence Mr. Hanafin dealt in greater detail with his comparisons. He also stated that the subject premises was situated at the back of the industrial estate and the roadway leading to it within the industrial estate was narrow.

Mr. Conroy in his sworn testimony described the good location of the subject premises with respect to the road systems in Cork City. He also stated that the established level for industrial buildings in the Cork City area was £2.25 to £2.50. Mr. Conroy also dealt with his comparisons and described them as new buildings like the subject.

The Tribunal has considered the written submissions and the evidence submitted by both parties. This is a newly constructed building, having been constructed in 1996. The Tribunal accepts Mr. Conroy's evidence that there is an established level for industrial buildings in Cork in the region of £2.25 to £2.50 psf. The Tribunal also accepts the evidence of Mr. Conroy that this is a well located property adjacent to an important new road system which would render the subject an attractive proposition for a hypothetical tenant. Accordingly, the Tribunal has decided that it will affirm the values based on:

Offices @ £3.00 psf

Warehouse @ £2.50 psf

Store @ £1.50 psf

However, the Tribunal has decided that the first floor over offices will not be taken into account when arriving at an NAV. In this respect the Tribunal accepts that this particular part of the property may have some potential, but it is unusable at the moment. Also the Tribunal will not separately value the storage yard as described in Mr. Conroy's submission, as it is

accepted that it is more in the nature of building ground and should be reflected in the overall valuation. Accordingly, to arrive at an NAV the Tribunal adopts the following assessment:-

Office	2,007 sq.ft. @ £3.00 psf = £ 6,021.00
Warehouse	6,524 sq.ft. @ £2.50 psf = £16,310.00
Store	143 sq.ft. @ £1.50 psf = <u>£ 214.50</u>
NAV	= <u>£22,545.50</u>

£22,545.50 @ 0.5% = £112.73. Say RV £113.

The Tribunal therefore determines the rateable valuation on the subject hereditament to be £113.